

Ethical Decision-Making in Healthcare: The Case of Nurse Amelia Brooks

Student Name

Institutional Affiliation

Ethical Decision-Making in Healthcare: The Case of Nurse Amelia Brooks

Healthcare practitioners frequently face difficult moral decisions that need rigorous thought and the application of ethical precepts. This essay discusses the ethical problem that Riverside Medical Center nurse Amelia Brooks encountered when it came to her conscientious objection to taking part in Sophie Turner's elective abortion operation. The case examines the complex interplay between one's convictions, professional obligations, and the values of autonomy, accountability, and non-maleficence. This essay will discuss the case study to pinpoint Nurse Amelia's moral problem and use the Ethical Decision-Making Model to provide a workable solution.

As requested to help patient Sophie Turner, whose request is within her legal rights, have an elective abortion, nurse Amelia Brooks is put in a difficult moral position. Amelia must balance her professional obligation to offer fair treatment with her conscientious objection, which is motivated by her strong personal views against abortion.

Ethical Decision-Making Model Analysis

The moral dilemma arises from Nurse Amelia's commitment to offer impartial treatment and her conscientious aversion to taking part in an elective abortion. An examination examining abortion service providers in Zimbabwe found that their negative view of women seeking abortion services was influenced by the cultural opinion that abortion is morally wrong (Chiweshe and Macleod, 2017). Conflicting ethical principles or values are at issue in moral dilemmas, which gives rise to arguments about how to weigh these principles and reach a conclusion (Beauchamp & Childress, 2001). The problem is made more difficult by the competing ideals of professional obligation and personal convictions.

Affected Parties

Dr. Rebecca Martin, who asks for help, Nurse Amelia Brooks, and patient Sophie Turner, whose autonomy and well-being are crucial, are important stakeholders. In addition to the persons directly engaged, coworkers, patients, and the healthcare facility are also impacted by the ethical dilemma.

Ethical Decision-Making Model

Researchers have found inconsistencies in ethical training, which has led to a request to include ethical decision-making models in training curricula and real-world scenarios (Burkholder, Burkholder, & Gavin, 2020). Regarding moral consciousness, Nurse Amelia can discern the complex conflict between her values and the responsibilities that come with her work. Her moral judgment, which carefully considers the three ethical concepts at stake—autonomy, professional responsibility, and non-maleficence—is based on her keen awareness. The intricate relationship between these values becomes especially difficult for her as she tries to balance preserving her professional obligations, honoring Sophie's autonomy, and keeping her word to "not harm."

Amelia's moral conduct is at the crossroads of both values; she must choose a course of action that respects Sophie's autonomy over her body and takes into account Amelia's conscientious opposition to the planned abortion. The core of ethical behavior is embodied in this complex decision-making process, which necessitates a careful and nuanced conclusion that demonstrates a dedication to individual autonomy and professional responsibility.

Factors Contributing to the Ethical Problem

Complexity is increased by Amelia's ethical problem, which involves her convictions, the patient's legal rights, and her professional obligations. Her battle with conformist reasoning is consistent with the findings of Dierckx de Casterlé et al. (2008), which place more weight on conformist reasoning than on critical thinking. The conflicting values in clinical nursing are brought to light by the impact of underlying somatic constructions on Amelia's moral judgments, which are based on

her opposition to abortion. Since ethical dilemmas in clinical nursing frequently include negotiating opposing values, finding a solution to her situation would necessitate sacrificing her personal and professional principles, impairing her capacity to offer compassionate and high-quality care (Robson et al., 2000). The instance emphasizes how important it is to support nurses in critical and creative thought, as this enables a more thorough approach to ethical decision-making that considers each individual's complexity.

Consistent with previous research, the majority of ethical challenges faced by medical professionals stemmed from their comprehension and application of abortion laws (Miljeteig et al., 2019). In their work, nurses are frequently confronted with morally challenging scenarios that go beyond life-or-death crises to include everyday problems. These moral judgments are supported by the ethical principle of justice, which is based on ideas of equality and fairness. Justice requires conformity to universal standards emphasizing individualism, objectivity, and optimism. Reliance on bioethical principles may not give sufficient advice in situations with unclear treatment advantages or competing interests between patients and healthcare providers because of possible discrepancies (Haahr et al., 2019). Under such circumstances, nurses can encounter moral problems similar to Nurse Amelia's.

Effectiveness of communication

In the case study of Nurse Amelia, communicating effectively is essential to resolving the moral problem. Amelia effectively and respectfully informs Dr. Martin of her conscientious objection, assuring openness regarding her moral position. However, how well she communicates with Dr. Martin—who could have different opinions—will determine its effectiveness. If Amelia doesn't express her issue adequately or Dr. Martin sees it as challenging to accept medical procedures, communication may be ineffective, and patient care may be jeopardized. Amelia has to communicate with empathy and transparency to be more productive. She should

encourage candid discussion, value other viewpoints, and maintain cooperative connections. Ineffective communication strategies, including being condescending or contemptuous, can damage our professional relationships, affecting the continuity of patient treatment and the team's cohesiveness. One of the outcomes of poor communication is a collapse in team trust within the medical community. As such, understanding the ethical aspects of the problem and promoting a cooperative settlement need excellent communication.

Professional Approach to Ethical Practice

Nurse Amelia takes a sophisticated approach to balancing competing principles to resolve the ethical problem. She exhibits moral awareness by acknowledging the contradiction between her moral obligations to care for others and her convictions. Her moral judgment entails weighing the values of non-maleficence, professional responsibility, and autonomy, which results in a deliberate decision-making process. Amelia searches for a solution that upholds the patient's conscientious objection and her independence in an ethical manner. Her attitude indicates her dedication to maintaining professional standards even in challenging ethical situations. The most important lesson for healthcare professionals is the value of proactive, compassionate, ethical involvement. Transparent communication and an emphasis on patients are vital components in resolving ethical quandaries.

Proposed Solution

As a solution to the moral problem, Nurse Amelia can ask to be transferred to a different assignment where her convictions are more in line with her duties as a professional, enabling her to give care without sacrificing her conscientious objection to abortion. Based on moral precepts, this approach upholds patient autonomy and puts their needs first. Amelia can maintain her dedication to delivering high-quality treatment while navigating the challenging ethical terrain thanks to the suggested strategy. From an interdisciplinary standpoint, by exhibiting a proactive and moral reaction to possible problems, this strategy could aid in developing beneficial

relationships. Fostering professional collaboration among healthcare professionals is contingent upon the organizational support afforded to conscientious objection accommodations and open communication.

Conclusion

The example of Nurse Amelia Brooks demonstrates the complex interaction in healthcare ethics between one's personal beliefs and professional responsibilities. The suggested course of action, in which Amelia thinks about relocating to fit her obligations with her values better, exhibits a thoughtful approach to moral decision-making. The example emphasizes the importance of autonomy, professional responsibility, and non-maleficence while highlighting how complex moral dilemmas are in the medical field. This investigation highlights the critical role that healthcare workers have in maintaining ethical norms and addressing moral dilemmas with honesty while protecting patient welfare.

References

- Beauchamp, T. L., & Childress, J. F. (2001). *Principles of biomedical ethics* (5th ed.). Oxford University Press.
- Chiweshe, M., & Macleod, C. (2017). 'If You Choose to Abort, You Have Acted As an Instrument of Satan': Zimbabwean Health Service Providers' Negative Constructions of Women Presenting for Post Abortion Care. *International Journal of Behavioral Medicine*, 24(6), 856–863. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12529-017-9694-8>.
- Miljeteig, I., Defaye, F., Desalegn, D., & Danis, M. (2019). Clinical ethics dilemmas in a low-income setting: a national survey among physicians in Ethiopia. *BMC Medical Ethics*, 20, 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12910-019-0402-x>.
- Haahr, A., Norlyk, A., Martinsen, B., & Dreyer, P. (2019). Nurses' experiences with ethical dilemmas: A literature review. *Nursing Ethics*, 27(1), 258-272. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0969733019832941>
- Burkholder, J., Burkholder, D., & Gavin, M. (2020). The role of decision-making models and reflection in navigating ethical dilemmas. *Counseling and Values*, 65(1), 108–121. <https://doi.org/10.1002/cvj.12125>
- Hervey, L. (2007). Embodied ethical decision-making. *American Journal of Dance Therapy*, 29(2), 91–108. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10465-007-9036-5>.
- Dierckx de Casterlé, B., Izumi, S., Godfrey, N. S., et al. (2008). Nurses' responses to ethical dilemmas in nursing practice: meta-analysis. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 63(6), 540–549.
- Robson, M., Cook, P., Hunt, K., & Alred, G. (2000). Towards ethical decision-making in counseling research. *British Journal of Guidance & Counselling*, 28(4), 533-547. DOI:10.1080/713652317.